

THE CITY OF HURON, OHIO
Proceedings of the Huron City Council
Work Session Meeting Tuesday, June 9, 2020 at 5:30 p.m.

A work session of the City Council of the City of Huron, Ohio was called to order by Mayor Sam Artino on Tuesday, June 9, 2020 at 5:30p.m. via Webex teleconference.

The Mayor directed the Clerk to call the roll. The following members of Council answered present: **Christine Crawford, Mark Claus, Monty Tapp, Sam Artino, Joe Dike, Trey Hardy and Joel Hagy.** Not present:

Also present on Webex call: Dr. Stephanie Walls and Scott Slocum.

Staff on Webex call: Interim City Manager Mike Spafford, Finance Director Cory Swaisgood,

New Business

City Manager Search

Mayor Artino said that Ms. Kilbury had several questions. Mr. Hardy said that one of the questions Ms. Kilbury had was compensation, and another was time limitation.

Jen Kilbury said that all she was looking for was an application deadline for the front cover. Typically, there is a section on compensation and benefits, and it usually includes a salary range, a benefits package briefly described, if you are going to be covering any moving or relocation expense, and a "to be considered" section, which would include a start date, the items you would like them to submit, such as a cover letter, resume, compensation expectations. In addition, it would typically include contact information so that if they have questions, they have somebody with a phone number, an e-mail address.

Mr. Artino said they had some discussion and talked about a 30-day time limit once the advertisement goes out for the application period. Mr. Hardy agreed that is correct. Mr. Artino said they had some discussion around the applications and the contact person being Terri Welkener, Clerk of Council, mostly for the fact that we have to keep the public records. Mr. Hardy said the one concern is we have to have a point person. Originally, we talked about the committee doing it, but he thinks if one person isn't set up as the gatekeeper, you may have something fall through the cracks. We threw a couple of options out there, and at the end, I think we figured that Ms. Welkener being Clerk of Council and kind of inundated with this stuff on a daily basis would be the best person so nothing gets missed or overlooked.

Mayor Artino asked if we had gotten anywhere with the compensation package. Mr. Hardy said that, for everyone's benefit, the previous City Manager had a salary of around \$116,000. There were some other benefits, including an allowance for a vehicle, so when it was all said and done, the package was \$120,000, plus there were some additional benefits about pension pick-up and different things. Mr. Hardy said that Mr. Spafford can share all of that in probably a little better detail. When you look at the country or the State as a whole, there is a City Manager salary study from 2018 (Mr. Hardy mistakenly said 2008) salary report. It goes by size of the community. In Ohio 5,000 to just under 10,000 had a mean salary of \$115,000, a median of \$110,000, and a low of just over \$80,000, almost \$81,000, and a maximum of \$171,000. Based on some of that information and where the previous City Manager was, that mean of \$115,000 is the starting point. We talked about it being based on experience and the compensation commensurate with the abilities determined through the interviewing process. That is the starting point to discuss. Asked if a range should be given, with salary based on experience, Mr. Hardy said that he didn't have a comment on that. Mr. Hardy thought you could leave it out, and then discuss it with people as the applications come in. Some

people may want to throw something on there and say it's between this and this. He doesn't know if there is a wrong or a right way there. Ms. Kilbury said the samples given to her, at a minimum, included a range.

Mr. Claus asked if the compensation should be listed in the advertisement as some sort of range, or should we just leave it off and discuss it with the candidates based on experience. Is it critical in the recruiting process to list a range? Mr. Slocum said that he has seen it all over the place. He doesn't do a lot of employment when it comes to public, but as long as you don't have the incumbent in place where it is a sensitive situation, I can see it either way. His personal opinion is that it doesn't hurt to put it in there. It is all public record, so if someone really wants to know, they will know. Our main objective is to attract the right candidate. If that piece of information tracks the right candidate, it also streamlines the process, which would be a positive. His personal opinion is that he always likes putting the salaries in there. You are highlighting the entire compensation package, not just the salary, and he thinks it is a selling point. Mr. Claus said it sounds like it should be a range instead of an amount so that you are not locked into something. Mr. Hardy said that Mr. White's salary was around \$120,000 with some other benefits.

Mayor Artino asked someone to suggest a range that we will go with on the brochure. Mr. Dike asked if we should use top 10% salary range, or do we want a hard number – start at \$100,000 and work our way up to \$125,000, that's just his thought. Mayor Artino said that when the package gets put together, we are going to have to vote on it. He said that he would like to see a range and if we can take into consideration what a community our size typically pays, we can go with that. Mr. Dike agreed and suggested a range of \$95,000 to \$140,000, which is just a wild guess. Mr. Claus said that is a big range. Ms. Crawford said there should be a caveat in there with an asterisk stating, "compensation is commensurate with experience."

With regard to the benefits package, Mayor Artino said we already have a benefits package that has been used in the past, and he thinks we can include all of that. He would like to say, from his own personal feeling, that if we are going to provide a car allowance, he thinks we need to support our local businesses and he thinks that the car allowance should be with the Ford dealership in this town. Mr. Claus asked if we pay for the car. Mayor Artino said we provide money to spend, and if they are driving anything but a Ford doing City business, he doesn't think it is right, and doesn't think we show support. Ms. Crawford asked what are the odds if somebody comes into town for this job that they bought that car at that dealership, and she thinks we are going to have trouble with that. Mayor Artino said that he understands that, and his other option would be that we lease a car, a Ford, and they can drive that for City business. He is not telling somebody what the drive on their personal time, but he believes that we need to start supporting our local business. We talk like we do, but those businesses are taxpayers and provide a lot of taxes to this community, and if we are going to ride around town conducting City business it should be (they have to obviously have to bid to get our business, so he is not saying that we provide a Ford from them unconditionally), but if we are going to represent this community, we represent it all the way, and that is his opinion. Mr. Hagy said that if the local business can provide the best price, then they are required, but if they can't then they can go anywhere they want. Mayor Artino said that we would put it out for bid for a Ford. Mr. Hagy confirmed that the Mayor meant that the City leases a vehicle. Ms. Crawford said that then the compensation includes a car, not a car allowance. Another Council member said that it would probably be more expensive for us. Ms. Crawford said that we are already down 9-22% this year so far. Mayor Artino said he is throwing it out there – if you don't want to support local business that's up to you. Ms. Crawford said she hasn't seen him in her store yet. Mayor Artino said he has a Ford, so he supports our local businesses. Mr. Hardy said that Mr. Tann drove a little red SUV or something like that, so he doesn't know how this came about – Mike might be able to shed some light on it. At the end of the day, you can eliminate all of this stuff and just say we are just going to build it into the package and they can do whatever they want. That will alleviate some of the back and forth on a car or not to have a car. You know they're going to have one. Mr. Claus said that it's not just the lease, it's insurance and everything else if the City provides the vehicle. Mr. Hagy said an allowance covers fuel and maintenance, generally; if we go lease you have the whole package. Mr. Claus said that an allowance is for someone to use their own car

– they are just given compensation to offset that. Mr. Hagy said that is set by the government and it is a set rate to cover fuel and maintenance. Mr. Claus said that is the case if you turn in mileage, but he was under the impression that the compensation was not based on mileage, it is a flat amount. Mr. Hardy confirmed that the amount is \$400/month whatever he drives and however far he drives; it is not in addition to mileage and fuel and all that other stuff. Mr. Hagy still thinks we are better off financially with an allowance than a straight-out lease. Ms. Crawford agreed and said that could always be a perk moving forward. Mr. Claus said if it is generally listed in the advertisement as a car allowance, it gives us some options to be part of the negotiation. Mr. Hardy said he would go a step further and just leave it out altogether. All of those benefits just fall as part of the compensation package. Mr. Claus said that is a good point and a reason to make that range wider, but list the insurance benefit package separately. Mr. Dike asked if everyone agrees to leave it out, and it can be discussed at the table. Mr. Claus said he thought that Mr. Hardy implied that it was included in the entire compensation package, so Andy's amount was up to around \$120,000 including the car allowance, so the range that Mr. Dike suggested of \$95,000 to \$140,000 gives us room to include that. Mr. Dike said that sounds good to him, as did Mr. Hardy.

Mr. Claus said the other information requested was date and what needs to be submitted. Ms. Kilbury said that is the cover letter, detailed resume and the compensation expectations. Mayor Artino said as far as the cover letter goes, the committee should be able to write that. Mr. Claus and Ms. Crawford said that the candidate is going to write that. Ms. Kilbury asked is there is anything else Council would like them to submit. Mr. Hardy asked if we have a standard application form that we utilize. Ms. Welkener said that we do have a standard application we have everyone fill out in general when they apply. Ms. Crawford said that usually with the higher up position they fill that out on their first day just to put it in the file. Ms. Welkener said that Mr. Swaisgood filled out that same application when he submitted his resume. Ms. Welkener said that she would send a copy of that application out to everyone. Mr. Swaisgood confirmed that he had submitted that form with his resume and cover letter, and that it contained general information such as name, address, work experience, etc. Mr. Hardy said that he didn't object because it would give the committee one standard form that everyone is going to fill out. Mr. Dike asked if the committee would be doing anything with references, maybe ask for 3-5 references. Ms. Crawford said that she didn't know that if that was a first round issue – sometimes that happens after the second interview. Mr. Dike said that makes sense to him, as far as waiting until the second round before checking references.

Mr. Claus asked if we want to look at an anticipated start date. Mr. Dike said around the middle of the third quarter. Ms. Crawford said it could be paraphrased to say the anticipated start date would be within 30 days of acceptance. If they are coming from another City, they want to give adequate notice, maybe take a week off to move, decompress, etc. Mr. Dike agreed with that point. Mr. Tapp said everything is negotiable, and we could put in 30 days, and if they say they are ready to go in 2 weeks, that can be changed. Mr. Slocum said that what they do at the School Board is have a target date, and once you get to a point where you are negotiating with your selected candidate, you can customize it to that situation. It is always good to have that date to start with. Typically, a candidate will send you a letter of interest letting you know they are interested and then you send back a packet. Some of these details that we are talking about here could be included in that packet, and not necessarily the initial promotional stuff that is being worked on. There might be a more detailed packet that goes to the candidate if you wanted to do that, which would include a lot of the detailed information. Mr. Artino said that he likes that idea, and we are looking at a date no later than the start of the fourth quarter, as it is already June. Ms. Crawford said, realistically, you are looking at closing applications in August. Mr. Claus asked when we think the advertisement will go out – next week or a couple more weeks. Mr. Artino said we need to approve costs first, and asked Trey and Dave if they have cost figures. Mr. Hardy said that the Clerk sent that information out this afternoon – there is some newsprint and then there is some website advertising. Some of the newsprint has some of the website advertising specific to the newsprint all factored in. Whenever you want to go there, we can talk about that as well. Mr. Artino said they would discuss cost after the discussion regarding start date is finished, because Council would have to approve that, for sure. Ms. Crawford wondered how fast the

committee is going to be able to make a decision figuring another 2-3 weeks for interviews and discussion, and then we would have to approve the hire, which would require a meeting date, which would probably mean October. Mr. Dike said, generally, that the candidate would be in place before the end of the year. Mr. Artino said that he would like to see if we can do this to have that person here with time to have some input to the budget, so that would be at the latest, October. Mr. Swaisgood said the budget goes to Council before December 1st, but we start the budgetary process in July, so anywhere between July and November timeline, that person could have some say in the budget. Dr. Walls said that she likes the idea of the 30 days language. We have an idea internally of when we would like to have someone in place, but given all of the moving parts, not to mention any possible challenges with getting people into town and things like that, the 30 days give us maximum latitude without us missing a hard deadline that we set to get someone in place. That doesn't mean that we can't aspire to have someone in place by October, but she doesn't know that we need to put that in writing – the 30 days gives us some flexibility. Mayor Artino said that sounds good to him. Mr. Hardy added that you can put immediate opening opportunity in the brochure so that they know it is now.

Mayor Artino asked Ms. Kilbury if there is anything else she needs. Ms. Kilbury asked that she still needed to know if there would be a moving or relocation package included in the brochure. Mr. Artino said they discussed that with Mr. White after he was chosen as the number one candidate. Mr. Hagy thought we should stay silent and let be a negotiated benefit. Ms. Crawford said she didn't think that should be included, either. Mr. Dike and Mayor Artino agreed. Mr. Dike commended Ms. Kilbury on the brochure – it looks good.

Mr. Artino said that we should come up with a not to exceed number for Council to consider. Mr. Hardy said in the e-mail that was sent out, every newspaper gave us a quote for a 1/8 page ad, some with color, some without, all for Sunday publication. The Plain Dealer was just under \$1,000 with publication on their website. The Toledo Blade, depending on whether you went color or black and white, was \$500 or \$750. It was an add-on to do their job site for 30 days. The Columbus Dispatch was right around \$950, and that included the online dispatch.com. Everything is fairly similar. The Cincinnati Enquirer was \$725 for paper only, and \$1,200 to do job postings on a few places, USA Today, the Job Network and their online paper. When you start looking at the web-only marketing, there are all kinds of different packages. The one package that I spoke with, Cleveland.com, the gentleman said it was about \$500. He listed a bunch of bullet points there. On Indeed.com, we can go on a create our own for free. ZipRecruiter had some stuff that didn't cost very much, but by the time you start wading through you don't get much exposure – they had a couple different plans that they suggest ranging anywhere from \$1,200 to \$550. Again, that is with someone that is working with you to help develop the ad and then working you over that 30-day period to coach you through to change this or tweak that. The Ohio City Managers Association did not have anyone in their offices right now and are working from home, but there is a lady who assured me that all we have to have is an account and we can go in and put all of this stuff on their website for free. Mr. Hardy thinks there are some opportunities to do a mix of both. To Mr. Artino's point, we should set a "not to exceed" marketing budget and then, again, who is going to be in charge of putting the ad together. That one might be a little bit easier suited for some committee members, which is another thing to be decided. Ultimately, Council will have to vote on it. Ms. Crawford said she doesn't know what the categories are out there, but there is a Jobs Ohio site on the state level. She is pretty sure those are free listings. She asked if Abbey Beamis fields any calls in professional categories, or are all of inquiries corporations and businesses trying to get set up. Mr. Hardy said he did not reach out to Ms. Beamis, but that is a good point. A member stated that you might be obligated to actually post on Ohio Means Jobs. Mr. Hardy said that is fine – he does that at work – so he's sure it doesn't take much to get that set up, and it is free. Mr. Artino said that looking at the numbers, we are somewhere around \$5,000-\$6,000 range, it might be a little more, so we might want to talk a little bit about that "not to exceed" number. Mr. Dike asked if Mr. Swaisgood has any feedback as far as money that we may not want to exceed from the financial side of things. Mr. Swaisgood said that he doesn't have an opinion on it, but what he can do is go back to see if you give him a "not to exceed" number,

he can shoot out an e-mail tomorrow to let you know where we are at budget-wise. He will see if he can make it work in the budget, but he might have to come back with additional appropriations. Mr. Dike asked if the committee should band together and put forth this plan and reach out and do this. Mr. Hardy said this would be an easier one if there was someone inclined to package together and then everyone approves that this is what the package looks like – it could be a committee member, or a couple committee members reaching out to the different sites, reach out the papers to set this up and do the advertising and marketing. It's something on the front side that you set it in motion and once you do it, you're done. Ms. Welkener would then manage it on the back side with all of the applications and inquiries coming in. Mr. Dike asked if there are any volunteers from the committee. There was no response. Mr. Dike said that he will help if there are some others on the committee that are willing to help him. Dr. Walls said that she is happy to help – we just need to go through these papers again and just get everything set up. Mayor Artino agreed, and said that there will be a spending limit decided hopefully in the next week or so, and we will give you all of that you can use all of that to figure this out. Mr. Dike said that he would be happy to work with Dr. Walls and asked if they should contact Mr. Swaisgood to get the invoices paid. Mr. Swaisgood said that if they can provide him with some proposals, we can talk over how to set it up budget-wise and get the PO's set up. Mr. Dike asked Mr. Hardy to forward all of his contact information to save time. Mr. Hardy said that he has some names and he will make sure Mr. Clark gets us what he has as well. Mr. Tapp asked the Mayor if we can come up with a number to give to Mr. Swaisgood so that he has an idea what we are looking, and then he can come back and say we can or cannot do it. Mayor Artino was thinking that Mr. Hardy and Mr. Clark have given us the numbers for the recruiters, and we definitely don't want to be near that. He would say not to exceed \$8,000-\$10,000. Mr. Tapp said he was adding up some of the numbers and he is thinking around \$8,000, and asked Mr. Swaisgood to let them know if that will work. Mr. Chojnacki said that as a matter of procedure, the administrative code provision Section 159.05(a) provides the City Manager up to \$25,000 with approval for purchasing authority. You can get that authority with the Director of Finance, as well. In lieu of creating a specific number, perhaps this discussion can serve as the general parameters by which Mr. Spafford in his interim capacity and Mr. Swaisgood can take reasonable steps toward making the necessary expenditures, and if you start encroaching upon that \$8,000-\$10,000, it would probably be appropriate for the Finance Director then to report back to the committee to advise of the total cost to date, and if there are modifications needed to the process of evaluating and selecting candidates. That could be discussed either at a meeting of the committee or in another meeting such as this. Mayor Artino and Mr. Tapp said that sounds good to them. Mayor Artino said that is hopeful that we can have everything we need in place by the meeting on June 23rd to actually kick this off and get the advertisements going. Mr. Dike said that as long as we have a draft and we vote on it to make sure it is able to be disseminated, that can happen. Mayor Artino asked that the group that is going to work on this have it done by June 23rd. Mayor Artino asked if there is anything else on the City Manager search from the committee or anybody else. Ms. Kilbury said that if anyone has any copy changes or photo suggestions other than what's already on there, she would be happy to work with them. It would be ideal if the committee was all on the same page so we aren't making multiple changes. If you see anything, she is definitely open to making those changes. Ms. Kilbury asked if the committee is just looking for something electronic at this point, or would you like any commercially printed pieces to go with it. Mr. Dike said that he thought everything should be electronic. Dr. Walls agreed that electronic would be adequate because even in the ad, if we could get the .pdf uploaded to the website, then we can just put the web address and then interested candidates can click there, go to our website, and download the .pdf.

Street Lighting Assessment

Mr. Spafford wanted to use this opportunity to present some of the additional information relating to the lighting assessment. As you know, this is a project we have been working on going back to 2005. We do it in increments of three years and it is a city-wide assessment that is used to pay for the utility costs and general maintenance of the streetlighting facilities across the City, as well as some capital improvement where the City actually converts from Ohio Edison on the streetlights to city-owned streetlights. One of the more prominent projects we worked on recently would be the addition of the street lighting along Main

Street. The proposed street lighting assessment has a target date to have the entire process finalized and submitted to the County Auditor by September 14th. It is on tonight's agenda for a first reading with a target to have it adopted finally by Council by resolution at the next meeting on June 23rd. What that does is kick off the process. From there, there is a public notice period, there is an opportunity going through the typical assessment process for an equalization board for any affected property owner over \$250.00 per year to present any type of challenge or case. There a couple of checks throughout the process. To highlight the specifics of the assessment itself, the three-year term that we are finishing out was at a 1.04 millage, which produced about \$220,000 per year. We are proposing a reduction of that; as we start to realize some of the new electric revenues from the Mucci Farms plan and arrangement, the discussion was always that we would start to utilize some of those electric funds for capital improvements for street lighting and rely less and less upon the street lighting assessment dollars. This is the first iteration of reductions, and we will continue to review that going forward. For some anecdotal math, he included in his report that a \$200,000 home, based on its assessed valuation and the 0.73 mils that was proposed by the County Auditor to hit our annual total that we would need, the total tax payment on that would go to about \$51/year, down from \$72/year. He wants to reiterate that our deadline is September to get this to the County Auditor, so we have a few months here of public notice and due diligence to work through. Again, it is on tonight's agenda strictly for a first reading, and the opportunity to present some of the basics and answer any questions, and give Council some time over the next couple of weeks to digest the program as a whole. Mr. Spafford asked if Council had any questions; he could take them now or talk about it in the Council meeting. There were no questions from Council.

Motion to adjourn by Mr. Tapp at 6:29 pm, all in favor. Mr. Artino adjourned the meeting.


Terri S. Welkener, Clerk of Council

Adopted: 23 JUN 2020

Upon approval by the City Council, the official written summary of the meeting minutes will become a permanent record, and the official minutes shall also consist of a permanent audio recording, excluding executive sessions, in accordance with Section 121.01(III) of the Administrative Code.